Assessment Guide and Pilot Study of Rangsutra’s Social Impact

Sandhya Bodapati and Grace Matthews
December 10, 2016
Assessment Guide and Pilot Study of Rangsutra’s Social Impact

Grace Matthews and Sandhya Bodapati
Global Social Benefit Fellowship
Santa Clara University

Prepared by:

www.scu.edu/millercenter
Table of Contents

Executive Summary: Introducing Rangsutra Fellows’ Work 4
Socioeconomic Impact Assessment Tool for Rangsutra 5
   Introduction 5
   Survey Questions 7
Socioeconomic Impact Assessment of Baseline Conditions in Barmer 9
   Purpose of Baseline Assessment 9
   Methodology 11
   The Socioeconomic Impact of Being a Woman with a Wage 11
   Results and Discussion 13
   Introducing the Bikaner Socioeconomic Impact Assessment 22
Bikaner Social Impact Assessment 23
   Emergent Themes 24
Overall Conclusion 28

Prepared by:

www.scu.edu/millercenter
Executive Summary: Introducing Rangsutra Fellows’ Work

Rangsutra links rural artisans to global markets, thereby providing equitable jobs while enabling economic stability and sustainable livelihoods. Rangsutra has a significant opportunity for growth and scaling its impact⁴, as it has begun to do in Barmer. To support this scaling, Global Social Benefit Fellows from the Miller Center for Social Entrepreneurship developed a socioeconomic impact assessment tool to measure Rangsutra’s impact on artisan employees. Fellows field-tested and refined the impact assessment tool. The fellows recommend Rangsutra continue to develop its capacity to assess its social impact assessment on artisans and their families. In doing so, the enterprise can enhance its reputation and attract interest from investors and other stakeholders to help it grow and scale.

Fellows used this impact assessment tool to collect baseline data in Barmer, where Rangsutra has recently launched a new venture, and gather impact data in Bikaner, a region with established Rangsutra operations. This report is three-fold, containing the socioeconomic impact assessment tool designed by the fellows, as well as assessments of Rangsutra’s impact in both, Barmer and Bikaner regions.

The fellows completed 131 interviews with participating artisans, of whom 100% were women. The women ranged in age from 16 to 55, with an average age of 31 years old. Sixty-one percent of the women artisans asked for more work, and the remaining 39% were content with the number of hours they were currently working. Just less than 100% of the participants worked for the local craft market at some point in time, if not simultaneously while working with Rangsutra, giving participants a comparative insight to the benefits of working for Rangsutra. Women artisans also saved 41% of their money on their own, in contrast to 24% of women who contributed to pooled household saving. Nine percent of money earned by women artisans went to education, for themselves or their families.


Prepared by:

[Logo of Miller Center for Social Entrepreneurship]
[Logo of Santa Clara University]

www.scu.edu/millercenter
The field work and assessment analysis found that centers in Barmer, and in particular Nagli Ri Dhani, Mahabar, the artisans have the capacity and desire for more work. Artisans in Barmer want to increase their embroidery skills to expand the scope of their orders. These observations point to several initiatives for improving Rangsutra artisans’ productivity and work quality. The request for increased work and more sophisticated technical ability could be met by instituting monthly skills-training session in Barmer. A greater range of skills can drive increased orders, and the system could be replicated in Rajasthan. In particular, the skills training could raise awareness of the need for quality production.

**Socioeconomic Impact Assessment Tool for Rangsutra**

**Introduction**

The following socioeconomic assessment questions have been developed based on prior research by the International Center for Research on Women and the United Nations Statistics Division. The survey questions connect to goals of alleviating poverty, providing quality education, reaching gender equality, and observing decent work and economic growth, or in other words, goals number one, four, five, and eight of the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals. Fellows chose these goals because Rangsutra’s mission is grounded in producing social value, so understanding the enterprise’s social impact is of utmost importance to quantify its success, especially in regards to establishing economic stability for women because of the positive ripple effects this success creates in establishing sustainable livelihood and improving the quality of life for a family.

In this survey, fellows address the challenge of measuring women’s socioeconomic empowerment compared to men within a household. Based on Rangsutra’s mission statement as well as conversations with over 130 artisan
shareholders, they have prioritized measuring income as the key impact indicator for the social enterprise. The following socioeconomic impact assessment tool is tailored specifically for Rangsutra to continue to gather impact data in its future. The fellows suggest that the survey be conducted on a one-on-one basis between an interviewer and artisan in order to collect candid responses. The survey should be administered on a regular basis to constantly track impact and monitor changes. The fellows recommend that the survey be administered biannually, or at a minimum, annually. Data should be saved and tracked in order to observe positive and negative trends in impact over time. Positive trends in impact should be included in annual reports, as well as other marketing materials.

Photo 1: A husband and wife tend to their livestock and household together in Mevaniyon Ri Dhani, in Mahabar, Barmer. The man has a job in the construction trade, and the woman is a craft manager for Rangsutra. All three of their children attend schools, and their oldest daughter, Mamta, age 18, just began working for Rangsutra while finishing her education.
Survey Questions

1) What is your name?

2) When there is work available—or in other words, when there is an order—how many days do you work per week?

3) On average, how many months in a year do you have this type of work and orders?

4) When you have work, how much do you earn in that month?

5) Ideally, how many months a year would you like to have this kind of work?

6) Ideally, how many hours a day would you like to work?

7) How many hours a day do you currently work when there is an order?

8) How much do you currently earn in a day if there is work?

9) How many children do you have?

10) How many boys do you have?

11) How many girls do you have?

12) How many people live in your household?

13) What is your household’s overall monthly income (in Rupees)?

---

2 This question is intended to help develop rapport. Question #20 is related, and protects those who wish to keep their responses anonymous.

3 This following series of questions 2-8 are intended to approach the impact indicator of income. Questions about earnings are asked in different ways in order to cross-check artisans responses, help in removing outlying data points, and ensure accurate responses from participants.

4 Questions 5 and 6 seek to help Rangsutra understand if particular work centers are meeting their craft-capacity or not, and thus help them assign more work to centers capable and interested in more productivity.

5 Over time, the fellows assume that Rangsutra’s work of allowing women employment opportunities in the workplace will begin to even the gender ratio of children due to changing community views about female infanticide.

6 Questions 12 and 13 aim to understand what fraction of a household’s income that women are contributing to. Fellows notice trends that women who are contributing more to overall household income are also expressing more agency.

Prepared by:

www.scu.edu/millercenter
14) How do you spend your money?\textsuperscript{7}
15) How is the rest of the household's income spent?
16) Do you have a bank account?
17) Do you go to a doctor or use medical services?
18) Do you have medical insurance?\textsuperscript{8}
19) Apart from working and earning money, are there any other benefits you receive from coming to centers?\textsuperscript{9}
20) Do you have any other comments or questions?
21) Would you prefer that your name is not attached to these responses and that the information remains anonymous, or does it not matter?\textsuperscript{10}

\textsuperscript{7} Answers to questions 14 and 15 should be categorized into the following groups: education, healthcare, clothing, nonessentials, general household needs, social expenses, savings, loans, and other.

\textsuperscript{8} While this question may not seem useful at the time because most artisans do not have medical insurance, fellows hope that over time, as incomes rise and women are able to afford more, medical insurance will become a more popular service.

\textsuperscript{9} Answers to this question should be categorized into the following groups: social opportunities, discussing medical and health-related topics, discussing family and household topics, freedom from the household and independence, ability to focus on work, motivation from others, and ability to learn new skills from other workers.

\textsuperscript{10} Upon completion of all survey questions, interviewer should say, “Please do not discuss the survey questions with others so that we can conduct the survey and collect responses the same way for every woman.”

Prepared by:

\[\text{www.scu.edu/millercenter}\]
Socioeconomic Impact Assessment of Baseline Conditions in Barmer

Purpose of Baseline Assessment

Before developing Rangsutra’s intervention in Barmer, Rajasthan, it was crucial that the enterprise develop a framework for continually measuring socioeconomic impact, and also collect a baseline assessment of conditions in Barmer prior to their actual intervention in the region.

Having socioeconomic impact data is only valuable and reliable when it can be contextualized. Collecting a baseline assessment of socioeconomic conditions in Barmer is absolutely necessary to be able to measure Rangsutra’s impact a few years after it has been in action. Quantifiable metrics taken before and after an enterprise’s intervention in a specific geographic location allows one to hypothesize important causal effects between the intervention and impact. For example, while in Bikaner, fellows gathered moving stories and witnessed improvements in artisan’s lives, but did not have a comparison point to see how much of a difference had been made to the artisans lives since they have been working with Rangsutra to actually give the enterprise credit for the artisans’ current states of livelihood.

Rangsutra should measure its impact using a variety of impact indicators in order to understand where it is succeeding most in providing social value to its 

Photo 2: Fellows interviewed 23 artisans in Bikaner, Rajasthan. Artisans in Bikaner had more to say about the benefits and improvements they have observed in their lives since working with Rangsutra. Several artisans from Bikaner also mentioned that the organization invited them to travel and do tours with them. Travel was never mentioned by artisans in Barmer.
beneficiaries, and where it needs to improve in order to ensure that it is maximizing its resources, funding, and capabilities. This will allow Rangsutra to foster holistic positive social impact to the overall enhancement to its beneficiaries livelihoods, in areas more than just income.

Furthermore, investment is the backbone of social enterprises. The Barmer study is particularly useful going forward, because it offers information about “how people’s lives changed as a result of a project or product, against the nonexistent counterfactual of what would have happened without it.”

Having social impact metrics to quantify the impact that a potential investment will create in the long run is critical to gaining the trust and support of investors.

---

Methodology

The socioeconomic impact assessment was used in Barmer. Note the emphasis on income, the primary impact indicator metric observed. This was appropriate because Rangsutra’s primary function as an enterprise is to provide employment opportunities for women. Along with income, the fellows measured willingness and interest to work, where women spend money compared to the rest of their family, and children gender ratios. In order to collect accurate and unbiased responses from the artisans interviewed, the fellows conducted interviews on a strict one on one basis.

The survey drafted for Rangsutra’s socioeconomic impact assessment was ultimately reviewed by Rahul Noble Singh before use in the field. The survey tool was tested and validated for eight weeks in Barmer and Bikaner in northwestern Rajasthan.

The Socioeconomic Impact of Being a Woman with a Wage

Upon entering a village work center, fellows provided a general introduction of the social impact assessment to the collection of women at the center before using a private room as the location for the private interviews. In nearly all cases, the interviews were conducted privately, only including the interviewee, the two fellows, and a translator. On rare occasions, when a woman was uncomfortable sitting for the interview alone and communicating with the male translator, an elder from the group was allowed to sit in the room but not contribute to responses in order to create a comforting environment. The fellows encourage Rangsutra to continue socioeconomic impact

---

12 The fellows acknowledge the importance of measuring education levels amongst women and their children as an impact indicator for social impact. An initial draft of the survey thus included questions about public versus private education, how many children a family was educating, etc. After conferring with Rahul Noble Singh, CFO of Rangsutra, in Rajasthan, the fellows were advised that the nature of the village schools in Northwestern Rajasthan made such questions irrelevant. Villages had one general primary education school that nearly all children attended, generally free of charge.
assessment using this same private one on one interview format to encourage candidness and a sense of safety amongst all participants.

Findings were collected based on 108 artisanal interviews completed in Barmer.
Results and Discussion

Time Spent Working

On average, artisans are currently working for 5.8 hours a day, but they would prefer to be working for 6.2 hours a day. The artisans are thus looking to earn for approximately an extra hour each day. Three hours working per day was the least number of hours reported by some artisans, and none reported currently working more than seven hours.

The average woman works seven days a week. No woman reported working less than six days a week. The average number of months which women actually worked per year was 6.78 months, and ideally, women wanted to work 9.39 month per year. No woman actually reported working less than six months per year, and none reported currently working more than nine months per year. Most responded saying they they preferred to spend the remaining few months attending to their fields, or helping their husbands with farming.

Nevertheless, the overall trend clearly suggests a need for more work orders in the Barmer region. Thirty-nine percent of the artisans were content with the amount they were working, and 61% of the women artisans asked for more work. Only one artisan out of 108 said that she was working more hours than she wanted to, and chose to work extra hours because she wanted earnings. This artisan was currently working 7 hours a day, and wanted to work 4 hours a day to allow her time with her three children at home.
**Income**

Artisans earn an average of

- Rs. 152 per day
- Rs. 3,075 per month

Artisans reported earning an average of Rs. 152 per day, and the median of the data set was at earning Rs. 150 per day. Per month, the average artisan reported earning Rs. 3,075, and the median of the data set was at earning Rs. 3,000 per month. Given the closeness between the average and median values for both daily and monthly earnings, fellows concluded a fairly unimodal distribution, with 50% of the artisans in Barmer earning more than Rs. 150 per day and 50% earning between Rs. 55 and Rs. 150. Similarly, 50% of the artisans earn more than Rs. 3,000 per month, while 50% earn between Rs. 450 and Rs. 3,000 per month.

The lowest monthly income was reported by Pappu Kanwar as Rs. 450, but Kanwar explicitly also stated her desire for more work, and suggested that she was currently unable to work for more hours because of how far away the centers were from her home. She shared that she was currently taking the lead on opening a new center in her own village. Pappu said that she would also be the craft manager in the new center beginning next month, so earnings from this role would certainly raise her overall monthly income, bringing her closer to the median income of Rs. 3000 per month.

The maximum income per month was reported by Mamta, an 18 year old worker with Rangsutra at Rs. 10,000. Mamta was still attending school, but enjoyed craftwork.

---

13 Between April and September of 2016, the minimum wage in Rajasthan was recorded as Rs. 211 per day for a semi-skilled worker. As artisans work with Rangsutra more regularly, the organization aims to increase daily wages to mirror this minimum wage standard.

Prepared by:
at Rangsutra. She works with her mother, Tulsi, to help run the center located in their home in Mevaniyon Ki Dhani. Mamta stated that 100% of her earnings go directly into her savings.

Pappu Kanwars’s story is an inspiring example of how Rangsutra enables women to make changes at the personal and community levels, impacting not only themselves, but their families, and in Kanwar’s case, the rest of her community. Mamta’s story is a clear example of opportunity and growth, and how her crafting skill level has grown because of Rangsutra. This apprenticeship program at Rangsutra allows artisans between ages 16 and 18 to practice and develop skills with the enterprise, while not interfering with their schoolwork and studying hours. Thus, apprentices are recognized as employees and are paid for their work. This is a fantastic opportunity for growth for artisans like Mamta, who attend school but seek a future in the crafting field to begin practicing their skills, placing them in a position to advance in their craftwork abilities and help others learn once they gain employee status.

**Monthly Household Income**

![Chart showing monthly household income distribution](chart.png)
Average household overall monthly income\textsuperscript{14} was reported to be Rs. 14,200, while the median of the reported values was Rs. 10,500. In the first quartile of data points, 25\% of the artisans reported average household overall incomes of Rs. 6,500 and lower, and in the second quartile, the next 25\% reported incomes between Rs. 6,500 and Rs. 10,500. The third quartile suggests that 25\% of artisans reported incomes between Rs. 10,500 and 30,500. The final 25\% of artisans had household monthly incomes between Rs. 30,500 and Rs. 50,000. This data suggests a bimodal distribution, with fifty percent of the artisans reporting less than Rs. 10,500, and of the remaining 50\%, half of them reporting household earnings on the higher end between Rs. 30,500 and Rs. 50,000 per month. Hopefully, with Rangsutra’s intervention, this fifty percent in the lower category of household earnings at Rs. 10,500 will grow to the third percentile of earnings and higher.

The minimum reported household income was Rs. 1,500 and maximum reported household income was Rs. 50,000, reported twice. Sushiya Devi reported earning only Rs. 1,500 per month because of her husband’s lack of ability. Due to a crippling brain injury that occurred years ago, her in-laws financially support her and her husband, as well as her four children. Kalavathi was one of two women who reported that her household earned Rs. 50,000. Given that they are a relatively high-earning household, Kalavathi shared that her family was saving to build a new house, as well as pay for their daughters to be married.

\textsuperscript{14} Average household overall monthly income includes the artisan’s income, and all other earners living in the same household. This value incorporated the income of extended family, parents, and any children who were earning while living in the artisan’s household. The fellows chose not to control for the size of a household when analyzing this data. They collected a large range of household income values between Rs. 1,500 and Rs. 50,000 per month. For households with smaller overall average incomes, the interviewed artisans’ income comprised of 30\% of the household monthly income, and for households with larger overall average incomes, the female artisan’s income comprised of 20\% of the overall income. Statistically speaking, smaller overall household incomes can be explained by fewer members living in the household, so it is feasible that the artisan’s share of the income is a larger percent of the overall income. For this reason, despite the fact that number of individuals in a household is not controlled for, the data collected for average household overall monthly income is still reliable.

Prepared by: www.scu.edu/millercenter
Women’s Share of Monthly Household Income

Comparing the average earnings for all 108 interviewed artisans, women comprised of 21.65% of monthly household incomes. Comparing the median of artisan’s monthly household incomes and overall household monthly incomes, women comprised of 28.57% of monthly household incomes, meaning that women earned nearly 30% of the household overall monthly income. Nationally, in 2012, women comprised 24.8% of all rural workers.\textsuperscript{15} Thus, one can observe that the percentage of women earning in the workforce in Barmer is comparable and on par with the national average.

Spending

Women put their income into savings 40% more frequently than did other family members. This greater amount of money saved has significant implications on how women view their opportunities for the future, because only “poor people who feel that they will have opportunities to realize their aspirations will have strong reasons to… invest in the future.”\(^\text{16}\) This speaks to the sense of hope and economic empowerment that Rangsutra provides these artisans. Furthermore, spending on education was fairly

common amongst the women. Gayatri shared that she is saving to send her kids to private school in the future, and that “not a penny of hers is spent.” Her husband takes care of the household: he is entrepreneurial in the marble business and in fact, hires someone else. The category “general household needs” primarily included spending on food, as well as shelter, water, and other basic needs.

Photo 3: The craft manager pictured (left) uses her earnings from Rangsutra to send her daughter to the local school in their village.
Children and Gender Ratios

7 unmarried women out of 108 total
Average of 3.74 children per artisan
1.89 boys for every 1.85 girls

Bank Accounts

92.5% have a bank account

Photo 4: Women are seen pictured walking to the local bank in order to deposit their recent checks. Bank accounts were local and conveniently accessible to all artisans in Mahabar, Barmer.

17 All unmarried women did not have children.
53.7% used medical services in the past 6 months
25% have in the past 2 years
8.3% have at some point in their life
And 13% never have

7.7% have medical insurance
Introducing the Bikaner Socioeconomic Impact Assessment

The socioeconomic impact metrics collected in Barmer need to be tracked in the upcoming years in order to contribute the positive changes in artisans’ lives to Rangsutra’s impact. While socioeconomic impact data collected in Bikaner is likely indicative of positive influence by Rangsutra, because baseline measurements were never taken in Bikaner when Rangsutra initially began working, it may be inaccurate to wholly contribute the advances in artisans’ lives to Rangsutra. For this reason, the fellows used more qualitative approaches to collecting socioeconomic impact data in Bikaner in order to highlight artisans’ opinions and reflections on how Rangsutra has impacted their lives.
Bikaner Social Impact Assessment

Since there is no baseline data available for this region, all of the data presented here is simply a snapshot of the current socioeconomic state. Although extensive baseline assessments were taken in Barmer in the summer of 2016, the two areas are not comparable. Some conclusions can be made about general conditions in Bikaner, but the sample size is small, and any comparison is discouraged.

Due to difficulties accessing restricted regions in the border areas, the sample size for the fellows’ impact assessment is 23 female artisans. Although there are limitations in analysis due to this sample size, interviews were conducted across 5 different centers to ensure as diverse a data set as possible. Although a larger data set would have been preferable, some general conclusions can be made about the region.
Emergent Themes

Younger women train in the apprentice program while they go to school. Some women were working on their breaks from school, while others took their courses remotely so they could be at home. Regardless of the form, 17% of the women were apprentices, and one woman also reported that two of her daughters were working as apprentices.

Rangsutra’s apprentice program allows women between the ages of 16 and 18 to work a limited number of hours throughout the week to allow them to learn skills from their mothers and other women in the community, while supplementing their family’s income. Every apprentice that the fellows spoke to was outgoing and driven, and most were going to school at the same time.

There are debates about child labor, but the families in this community perceive apprenticeships for girls aged between 16 and 18 to be valuable. This passes on the craft tradition of this community, and provides economic benefits to family by enhanced income.

---


Prepared by:
Multiple family members are involved. Seventeen percent of women mentioned that they had a family member also working for Rangsutra. This question was not included in the survey, and the women volunteered this information, meaning that due to underreporting, this percent may be even higher. It also suggests that employing multiple family members is valued by the artisans. This also suggests that the range of work opportunities available to people through Rangsutra is valuable. While many of the women reported that their mothers, grandmothers, or daughters were working for Rangsutra, some women also reported that their husbands or sons were as well, although not in the traditional role of embroidery. By offering a diverse set of work opportunities, Rangsutra is able to employ, and therefore impact, more and more people.

Women want to work. While there is a widely held belief that people suffering the effects of poverty only continue to do so because they are not working hard enough, the fellows’ findings did not support this myth that there is a lackluster amount of motivations in poorer communities, and nor does most research.\(^{20}\)

---

Women currently work a little over 9 months a year, and they want to work 10. Most women cannot work a full year because of the agricultural responsibilities they hold. They want to work more than an hour more per day than they currently do. Seventy percent of women reported working 7 days a week, if there were no social responsibilities which they had to take care of. Zero women reported that they would like to work less. The ambition and eagerness of the women was obvious in nearly every interview in Bikaner, and the women were proud to work for Rangsutra.

Women are also working for reasons beyond purely income. Eighty-three percent of women were able to list reasons other than working and earning for what they saw as benefits of working in a center-based system like Rangsutra.

**Women’s spending does not differ too drastically from other member’s in their households.** In the interviews, fellows asked women what they spent their personal income on, as well as what the rest of the household spent their earnings on. Women reported spending their personal earnings on education less frequently than the rest of the household by 13%. Eight percent of women spent on social expenses, compared to 4% of the rest of the household. Women did save 9% more frequently. Spending on nonessentials, healthcare, and general household needs did not differ between the employed women and other members of their own households. This was a surprising, although not disappointing finding. While there is research that supports the fact that women spend more responsibly than men, this is not substantiated by the fellows’ findings.
Women are major household contributors. Some of their husbands are bedridden while others work in the fields, but regardless of why their husbands are unable to contribute to the household income, women are choosing to earn. On average, women supply 26% of their household’s earnings. Some of these women were contributing very small amounts of money, such as the women who were working as apprentices on their school vacations, while others were contributing 100% of their household’s income.

As Rangsutra looks forward to continuing their impact in this region, this kind of data, both qualitative and quantitative, is crucial for their continued social impact monitoring. Since there is no baseline data in Bikaner, this data can be seen as a benchmark of the current state of affairs from which goals can be set for future improvements.

Photo 7: Women are major household contributors. Rangsutra gives women the opportunity to work enough to support their families. Sugna’s husband is currently studying, and therefore contributes no income to the household. Sugna is currently working from home because of her newborn baby, but wants to work in the center to be able to focus on her work. By providing Sugna a job, Rangsutra allows her family to stay afloat.
Overall Conclusion

In conclusion, the fellows strongly recommend the implementation of the socioeconomic impact assessment survey tool on a regular basis in order to track social impact. The potential for measuring impact in Barmer is huge, especially given that the fellows collected baseline information from the majority of Rangsutra’s artisan employees there. This data can be used to improve operational efficiency, market products, and attract investments.

With time, the fellows hope to see an increase in all of the socioeconomic impact metrics, implying growth and further success in enabling sustainable livelihoods for women in the Barmer and Bikaner regions. The fellows recommend that Rangsutra set a 1-year, 5-year, and 10-year goal for improvements which the enterprise hopes to solicit. These goals are tangible products which can be shared with future investors, to help make them possible.
Works Cited


Prepared by:

www.scu.edu/millercenter


Photo Credit to Santa Clara University